

5.2 BAY STREET PROJECT PRESENTATION

Discussion of Street Improvement Options for Bay Street in Irvington

Contact Person:

Name:	Jake Lavin	Roger Ravenstad
Title:	Redevelopment Project Manager	City Landscape Architect
Dept.:	Housing and Redevelopment	Engineering
Phone:	510-494-4428	510-494-4696
E-Mail:	jlavin@ci.fremont.ca.us	rravenstad@ci.fremont.ca.us

Executive Summary: The Bay Street Planning and Implementation Project consists of developing a final design concept for street improvements along Bay Street, new zoning regulations for adjacent properties, and a possible Business Improvement District (BID) that addresses ongoing implementation measures along Bay Street. The project is funded by a Transportation for Livable Communities (TLC) Planning Grant from the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) and by Redevelopment Agency funds. A steering committee consisting of three Bay Street stakeholders, elected by their peers at a kick-off meeting, and two City staff are overseeing the project. The steering committee has narrowed its focus to two concepts for the street improvements and seeks the City Council's comment and direction on the concepts and other design options at this early stage in the design process. The steering committee will be returning to the City Council in February to discuss a final draft Concept Plan for the project and then again in May to seek final approval of concept plans and the zoning regulations.

BACKGROUND: Bay Street could become a successful pedestrian-oriented retail district, but there are many hurdles to overcome to reach that potential. First and foremost, parking needs to be improved. The properties on the south side of Bay Street between Trimboli and Chapel consist of single homes converted to commercial uses in the front and residential units in the back (in some cases). Tenants, residents and customers park on the street, but the numerous curb cuts reduce the number of possible on-street parking spaces. People also park on the concrete aprons that were once front yards for the single family homes as well as in the driveway areas. The hodge-podge of parking arrangements does not adequately support the existing businesses and discourages new investment in the area. In addition to the parking problems, the area is cluttered with overhead utility poles and wires. And, the parcels are very small – roughly 5,000 square feet on the south side of Bay Street between Trimboli and Chapel – which also discourages new investment.

Staff, the community and land developers agree that Bay Street has a distinct, quirky and appealing “feel” that can be the basis for creating an interesting and successful place. The historic buildings at the Five Corners area and the streetscape improvements funded by the Agency in the early 1990s help create this character, as do the successful and complementary tenants. Existing uses include the community theater, several clothing and gift boutiques, several restaurants, food stores, and salons and convenience services. Illustrating the potential of Bay Street, the preferred developer selected for the Monument Center redevelopment project (now terminated) had planned to focus significant new investment in retail development along Bay Street. The potential of Bay Street was also discussed at a Developer Panel held during the Irvington Concept Plan process.

The Bay Street Planning and Implementation project is intended to set the framework for, and thereby encourage new investment along Bay Street. On October 22, 2002, the Redevelopment Agency authorized the Executive Director to propose a local match in support of a grant application to the Metropolitan Transportation Commission's (MTC) Transportation for Livable Communities ("TLC") grant program, and in January 2003, MTC awarded the Agency a \$68,000 grant for the Bay Street Planning and Implementation project. The TLC program provides grants for planning and capital projects that integrate walking, transit, and bike riding into the community design and that spur the compact development of housing, downtowns and regional activity centers. The Bay Street project consists of:

- Development of final concept designs for street improvements along Bay Street to support a grant application to MTC and possibly other funding sources to construct the improvements. The City's Capital Improvement Program has appropriated a total of \$700,000 of RDA funds for the design and construction of the Bay Street streetscape, but additional funds will be required to complete the improvements. The final streetscape design will also address utility undergrounding issues to facilitate the design and implementation of utility undergrounding on Bay Street, for which the City Council has approved the use of Rule 20a funds.
- Development of clear, flexible zoning regulations to allow for shared parking and more compact development along Bay Street. There is development interest in Bay Street but current zoning does not allow investments consistent with the draft Irvington Concept Plan, however, the Planned District resulting from the project will encourage such investment. The Planned District will encompass all of the properties adjacent to Bay Street and Papazian Way between the Five Corners and Chapel Way, with the exception of those properties that are part of the Monument Center block.
- Potential creation of an assessment district (e.g. Business Improvement District) to address ongoing implementation measures along Bay Street. If there is sufficient property owner interest in the formation of an assessment district to provide additional maintenance, security or marketing activities for the street, the project may include a proposal to form such a district.

Successful completion of the Bay Street project will transform the infrastructure for the area, but significant additional public and private resources will be needed for Bay Street to realize its potential. As part of the ultimate implementation of this project, the above-ground utility poles and wires would disappear from sight. A wide sidewalk would connect the businesses and street trees would line the street. Customers would be able to find more on-street parking in a more convenient format. New zoning regulations would codify design standards and development incentives. A new business improvement district could conceivably form to focus on improving and maintaining the street's vitality. These improvements and measures would provide a catalyst for new investment, but the investment needed to transform Bay Street into a Castro Street in Mountain View or a University Avenue in Palo Alto is tremendous. The realization of Bay Street's potential will take many years and millions of dollars, but an initial investment in street improvements, parking and good planning has been a winning formula in other successful retail areas and is a logical next step for Bay Street.

Community Engagement: Community participation is especially important for the project for a number of reasons: (1) it will build consensus around the numerous design challenges that the project will present (for example, parking, traffic circulation, historical context, and mixed-use buildings); (2) it will

assist in applying for capital grants for final design and construction of the street improvements by demonstrating that community concerns were incorporated into the design (thus reducing possible obstacles during the capital project state); and (3) it should increase property owner interest in investing in their buildings and in a potential business assessment district. Staff contacted all of the property owners and business owners along Bay Street to organize a Steering Committee for the project. The Steering Committee meets regularly with the consultant, reviews and provides comments on technical documents, and represents the project at community meetings and public hearings before the Planning Commission and City Council. Attendees at a kick-off community meeting elected a Steering Committee for the project consisting of the following three community members:

- Wendy Hamor, owner of Bay Street Coffee Company
- George Matta, property owner
- Farouk Mattar, property owner

The Steering Committee has met six times since the design process started. Whenever possible, staff has provided notice of Steering Committee meetings to the Bay Street property owners, business owners, tenants, and interested parties, and the meetings have consistently attracted a few other regular contributors. Pearl's Café and the owners of the portion of Monument Shopping Center adjacent to Bay Street have been the most consistent of the other participants in Steering Committee meetings.

The Steering Committee has also kept the Bay Street community and interested parties informed of the project through the production and distribution of three one-page Project Updates and by posting sets of plans at the Bay Street Coffee Company and the NewTech Law Group. Plans and information on the project are also posted on the Irvington web site. The interested parties with perhaps the greatest stake in the project are the property owners adjacent to Bay Street. Of the 30 properties adjacent to Bay Street between Fremont Boulevard and Chapel Way, owners of 18 of these properties have attended at least one Steering Committee meeting or Community workshop.

The Agency has sponsored two general community meetings for the project – one in August and the second in October. For the second community meeting, the Steering Committee and a few other volunteers divided up the interested parties list and attempted to personally remind them of the meeting.

DISCUSSION:

Design Process: At the first community workshop, the selected design consultant, RRM Design Group, presented four contrasting plans for Bay Street to spur discussion and elicit key concerns and issues. Ideas for the plans came from previous work on Bay Street completed as part of the Irvington Concept Plan process, site visits and other background information, and interviews with stakeholders. The four sketches introduced ideas such as a rear parking alley behind the Bay Street businesses, perpendicular parking, parallel parking, extension of one-way travel to Trimboli, parking lot development near the Post Office and on Monument Center, public plazas, two and three-story infill development, different examples of bulb-outs at the intersections, different densities of street trees, and different sidewalk widths. None of these sketches took hold with the community, and the consultant was sent back to the drawing board to find more parking, and specifically diagonal parking.

Participants at the second community meeting discussed three new plans focused on parking lot development, diagonal parking, and street parking options for Trimboli and Papazian. To achieve

diagonal parking while minimizing right-of-way acquisition, one plan introduced the idea of making Bay Street one-way from Five Corners to Chapel Way. Other concepts of these plans include parking lot development at a mid-block location along Bay Street and also Papazian Way, different ways for private property owners to access and develop rear parking and underground parking, and various options to access a possible post office parking lot development from the church and school property on Chapel Way and Irvington Ave. Most attendees expressed support for plans involving diagonal parking, including diagonal parking with a one-way traffic pattern, even though these plans were thought to require acquisition of a strip of land up to 20 feet wide along the south side of Bay Street. This strip of land would come from the front yard setbacks of the properties located on the south side of Bay Street between Trimboli and Chapel, and as previously discussed these setbacks have been paved over and currently are used for on-site parking.

The Steering Committee has also presented what it views as key success factors for the project at this stage in the project:

- *Feasibility:* the plans need to be sensitive to the needs of current property owners and businesses. Businesses need to remain operational during construction and plans should accommodate deliveries and trash pickup. Purchase of private property generally should be pursued on a more-or-less consensual basis. The Steering Committee hopes that there will be strong property owner support for the street design, which will require some property acquisition and the elimination of the existing parking in the front yard areas on the south side of Bay Street.
- *Flexibility:* the community does not know exactly what Bay Street will become, but it wants to put in place the building blocks that will facilitate more investment and keep options open for Bay Street. Will Bay Street become a night life area? Will it remain small shops? Will there be two- and three-story buildings? Will there be apartment or condo flats above commercial space? For now, the Steering Committee wants to allow for flexibility for the vision to evolve. This can be done by increasing parking and improving the streetscape, both of which increase development potential. Ultimately, the development regulations created as part of the planning project will articulate the vision for Bay Street.
- *Cost:* Agency staff provided a working budget to construct street and parking improvements along Bay Street over the next 3-5 years. The budget is \$2.5 million for the hard costs of construction and row acquisition. This budget was derived from the existing appropriation for the project that will remain after the planning project is completed (estimated to be \$500,000-\$550,000), the availability of grant funding from the MTC's TLC capital grant program (\$2 million) or other possible grant sources, utilization of previously appropriated funds for parking lot development in Irvington that have been suspended pending the long-term outlook of Redevelopment Agency budget (\$1 million). A final budget would need to be approved by the City Council and would take into account funding sources, project design and other funding priorities. The Steering Committee believes that the first phase of improvements should be designed within a \$2.5 million hard construction budget to maximize the chances of completing the project.

Design Alternatives:

Discussion of the three plans and the above success factors at the October 2 community meeting led to five follow-up studies:

- Diagonal parking on both sides of Bay Street with one-way circulation
- Diagonal parking on the west side of Trimboli Way, rather than the east side
- More sharply angled diagonal parking to minimize right-of-way acquisition

- Possibilities for a future underground structure between Bay Street and the Post Office
 - Evaluation impacts of a one-way circulation pattern
- After review of these studies, the Steering Committee has prepared a presentation of several design ideas that follow below. City Council is asked to provide comment and direction on the options. The Steering Committee will take this direction back to the community at the next community meeting scheduled for December 4, 2003 at 6:30 p.m. at the Irvington Presbyterian Church and the design process will continue. The next steps of the design process are also described in detail below.

Bay Street: Two-Way Traffic with Diagonal Parking (Alternative I)

<i>Plan description:</i>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One-way traffic pattern from Fremont to Trimboli and two-way traffic pattern from Trimboli to Chapel • Parallel parking with 8' sidewalks on the north side of Bay Street • Diagonal parking with retail sidewalks (12') on the south side of Bay Street • Extensive streetscape enhancements (trees, lights, benches, trash receptacles, etc.) • Small plaza at Trimboli and Bay Street • Driveway access to larger properties (2 or more lots) 	
<i>Parking impact</i>	+ 28 on-street spaces (net) <u>- 45 on-site spaces (would be reduced as larger lots added on-site parking)</u> - 17 net loss of parking
<i>Potential to support new investment</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aesthetic improvements are appropriate for a pedestrian retail district • On-street parking will be more convenient • New building shown on Monument Center per owner's plans • Larger properties could support new development with on-site parking • Additional parking would be needed to support new development on properties too small for on-site parking
<i>Preliminary estimate for hard costs</i>	\$920,000 (street improvements) <u>+ \$440,000 (streetscape enhancements)</u> \$1,360,000 Total
<i>Feasibility considerations</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Requires 16' ROW acquisition on south side of Bay Street (between Trimboli and Chapel) and 3-5' ROW acquisition of Bridgeway East • Requires 12' ROW acquisition of Monument Center lot along Bay Street (owner is currently opposed to ROW acquisition). • Significant disruption to business during construction without replacement parking elsewhere • Potential conflict with existing tenants and residents who could no longer park on-site • Trash collection and deliveries would be inconvenient

Bay Street: One-Way Traffic with Diagonal Parking (Alternative II)

<i>Plan description:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One-way traffic pattern from Fremont to Chapel • Parallel parking and diagonal parking (30 degree angle) with 8' sidewalks on north side of Bay Street • Diagonal parking (30 degree angle) with retail sidewalks (12') on the south side of Bay Street • Streetscape enhancements (trees, lights, benches, trash receptacles, etc.) • Small plaza at Trimboli and Bay Street • Driveway access to larger properties (2 or more lots) 	
<i>Parking impact</i>	+ 25 on-street spaces (net) - 45 on-site spaces (would be reduced as larger lots added on-site parking) - 20 net loss of parking
<i>Potential to support new investment</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aesthetic improvements are appropriate for a pedestrian retail district • On-street parking will be more convenient • New building shown on Monument Center per owner's plans • Larger properties could support new development with on-site parking • Additional parking would be needed to support new development on properties without the possibility of on-site parking
<i>Preliminary estimate for hard costs</i>	\$700,000 (street improvements) + \$470,000 (streetscape enhancements) \$1,170,000 Total
<i>Feasibility considerations</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One-way traffic pattern presents a risk to the success of retail development along Bay Street and disruption to local travel patterns • Requires 14' ROW acquisition on south side of Bay Street (between Trimboli and Chapel) and 3-5' ROW acquisition of Bridgeway East • Requires 4' ROW acquisition of Monument Center lot along Bay Street (owner is currently opposed to ROW acquisition) • Significant disruption to business during construction without replacement parking elsewhere • Potential conflict with existing tenants and residents who could no longer park on-site • Trash collection and deliveries would be inconvenient

Papazian Way: Diagonal Parking (Option I)

<i>Plan description:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Diagonal parking on both sides of Papazian• Minor streetscape enhancements (trees and planters) with 8' sidewalks	
<i>Parking impact</i>	+ 17 on-street spaces (net) <u>- 4 on-site spaces (net)</u> + 13 net gain of parking
<i>Potential to support new investment</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The additional parking could help mitigate the impacts of the street improvements along Bay Street and potentially could be allocated as an incentive to new investment within the Planned District boundaries.• On-street parking will be more convenient
<i>Preliminary estimate for hard costs</i>	\$400,000
<i>Feasibility considerations</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Requires 5-18' ROW acquisition

Papazian Way: Diagonal Parking with Surface Parking Lot (Option II)

<i>Plan description:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Combination of parallel and diagonal parking with 8' sidewalks• Minor streetscape enhancements (trees and planters)• Small surface parking lot (could be located as shown on the plans or at either corner of Fremont and Papazian)	
<i>Parking impact</i>	+ 6 on-street spaces (net) <u>+ 12 parking lot spaces (net)</u> + 18 net gain of parking
<i>Potential to support new investment</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The additional parking could help mitigate the impacts of the street improvements along Bay Street and potentially could be allocated as an incentive to new investment within the Planned District boundaries.• On-street parking will be more convenient• Parking lot would be visible from Fremont Boulevard which could increase customer traffic for businesses
<i>Preliminary estimate for hard costs</i>	\$920,000
<i>Feasibility considerations</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Requires 5' ROW acquisition• Acquisition of property for a parking lot requires relocation of existing businesses

Small Surface Parking Lot on Current Post Office Employee Lot

<i>Plan description:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Development of Post Office employee parking lot on vacant adjacent property• Development of public parking area on portion of current employee parking lot near Trimboli	
<i>Parking impact</i>	+ 20-25 net gain of parking
<i>Potential to support new investment</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Small parking lot would be well situated to serve Bay Street.• The additional parking could help mitigate the impacts of the street improvements along Bay Street and potentially could be allocated as an incentive to new investment within the Planned District boundaries.
<i>Preliminary estimate for hard costs</i>	\$560,000
<i>Feasibility considerations</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Requires acquisition of vacant parcel adjacent to Post Office, which the owner plans to incorporate into a new development.• Requires a complex transaction with the Post Office.• Would be the first step of a longer term effort to develop a parking lot alley behind the Bay Street businesses or a larger surface parking lot encompassing both the existing Post Office employee parking lot and vacant parcel adjacent to the Post Office.

Parking Lot Development Between Bay Street and Post Office

<i>Plan description:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Development of a parking lot alley behind the Bay Street businesses with 6' sidewalk adjacent to rear of Bay Street buildings• Pedestrian alleys to connect the lot to Bay Street• Potential underground structure accessed from Post Office customer parking lot for replacement parking for Post Office (an alternative would be to develop a parking deck for replacement parking of the south half of the Post Office property)	
<i>Parking impact</i>	+ 93 surface spaces (net) + 55 underground spaces (net) + 148 net gain of parking
<i>Potential to support new investment</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Significant additional parking provided for area• Parking well located to support investment along Bay Street• Remaining property depth of approximately 60-70' sufficient to allow for retail and commercial depths
<i>Preliminary estimate for hard costs</i>	\$3,120,000
<i>Feasibility considerations</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Layout designed so that the parking spaces could be developed in a piecemeal fashion, although access would need to be developed at one time.• Layout designed so that existing buildings are not impacted• Requires acquisition of vacant parcel adjacent to Post Office and Seneca Center.• Requires a complex transaction with the Post Office.• May require acquisition of rear setback area of Bay Street properties.

Explanation of preliminary cost estimates: The cost estimate is very preliminary at this point, and is likely on the low side. The plans have not been subjected to any engineering evaluation. Soft costs related to the project are not included. Soft costs include design and engineering costs, site investigations, environmental analysis and documentation, appraisals and other ROW acquisition-related costs, construction inspection, staff costs and permitting costs. Soft costs typically add up to approximately 40% of the hard costs of ROW acquisition and construction of a project. It assumes a uniform acquisition cost per square foot of required right-of-way but it does not include any contingency for additional compensation that might be claimed by a property owner or relocation-related costs if the acquisition involves a building (in the case of parking lot development on Papazian for example). Acquisition-related costs will be analyzed more closely once a concept plan is developed. The cost estimate also does not include any drainage or other subsurface work. The need for any such work will be analyzed more closely once a concept plan is developed.

One-way versus two-way traffic: The traffic consultant for the project evaluated a possible one-way traffic configuration and concluded that it would perform operationally. It would result in longer travel periods due to the restriction of traffic in one direction and it would also probably result in a modest increase in traffic in the residential area of Bay Street near Grimmer. There would be disruption to other local traffic patterns as such as traveling to the post office. But a concern of both staff and the Steering Committee is that a one-way traffic pattern will have a negative impact on the commercial viability of the properties west of Trimboli. Essentially, the one-way pattern makes it is easier to miss a destination and harder to return to try again. One-way patterns are successful where people can use a return one-way streets to easily travel up and down a district. The logical “return” for Bay Street is either via Grimmer and Fremont Boulevard or via Irvington Avenue. Neither of these routes is particularly easy. The Irvington Avenue route is much shorter but it would require a series of left hand turns that would discourage use of the route. If the parking alley connecting Chapel Way to Trimboli were developed, a one-way traffic pattern might pose less risk to the commercial viability of the area. At this point, the Steering Committee and staff recommend a two-way traffic pattern, but there has been interest in the one-way pattern.

Status of discussions with Post Office regarding cooperation on parking: Staff held several discussions with the Post Office late in 2002. The Post Office does not plan to close the facility and reports that the operation is currently constrained by parking. The Post Office is open to discussing a transaction with the City to develop more parking. Their key criteria are: (1) any employee parking needs to be separated from general public parking; (2) any new public parking can-not compromise the Post Office site’s security; (3) the Post Office is unable to contribute any funds to new parking lot development; and (4) the Post Office needs to maintain and ideally increase its employee and / or customer parking through any transaction with the City. Staff discussed a potential transaction that would involve the acquisition and development of employee parking on a vacant property adjacent to the employee parking lot, and shifting the employee parking west. This would free up approximately 20-25 spaces near Trimboli that would become public parking spaces for retail and Post Office customers. At a later date, the employee parking lot could be relocated to a parking deck on the south side of the property to free up the employee parking lot of approximately 40 spaces for additional public parking. The Post Office thought that such a transaction could be negotiated but several technical details would need to be worked out. Staff has not had subsequent discussions with the Post Office other than to advise them of the Bay Street planning efforts.

Next steps and schedule: Following comment and direction from the City Council, the Steering Committee will narrow the number of plans that are considered going forward to a single plan after the next community meeting in December. The Committee will also begin work on development standards for the area and the Planned District proposal. Following the community meeting in December and subsequent community meeting in January the Committee will prepare a draft concept plan for the street improvements and draft Planned District proposal. Staff and the Committee will seek comment and direction from the Planning Commission and City Council on the draft work products in February or March. Consideration of the final design concept and Planned District proposal will likely occur in May or June.

Implementation: If the City Council approves the plans for Bay Street and the Redevelopment Agency Board authorizes staff to begin implementation of the project, staff would propose applying for grant funding through MTC's TLC program and possibly other sources. The next call for capital projects in the TLC program is spring of 2005. Prior to that application, staff would make sure that the plans were well coordinated with the planned utility undergrounding for Bay Street. Another logical first step would be to pursue any public parking lot development that is included in the final plans, as additional parking will be needed to mitigate the impacts of the project on Bay Street businesses. Finally, there would remain considerable design work to complete construction documents from the schematic designs that are completed as part of this project. If the Agency directed staff to pursue grant funding, the project probably could be under construction in 2006.

ENCLOSURE:

- Bay Street Alternative – Two-Way Traffic Pattern
- Bay Street Alternative – One-Way Traffic Pattern
- Papazian Parking Options
- Post Office Parking Lot study

RECOMMENDATION:

Receive presentation from Bay Street Steering Committee and provide comment on design options.

